

Full Length Research Paper

Teaching from the postmodern edge: The intersection of education and cultural studies in the contemporary Caribbean

Orville Beckford^{1*} and Disraeli Hutton²

¹Department of Sociology, Psychology and Social Work, UWI, Mona, Kingston 7, Jamaica.

²Humanities and Education Faculty-School of Education, University of the West Indies, Mona, Kingston 7, Jamaica.

Received 24 August, 2022; Accepted 5 October, 2022

This article consists of an examination of programmes at the University of the West Indies (UWI) for cultural relevance. In examining the cultural content and relevance of teaching, a deeper look at the teaching and learning process within the contemporary period will be done. The multicultural nature of postmodern society results in the intersecting dialectics of what is taught being equally important to how it is taught and to whom it is being taught. The works of Jean-Francois Lyotard and Anthony Giddens are used to show how knowledge is perceived in this contemporary period of new capitalism. The cultural studies discourses of these and other writers are used to identify the lacuna - termed the "missing dialectics" - within the teaching and learning process facing educators at the UWI and elsewhere in the contemporary Caribbean. Culture should be at the center of the pedagogic/andragogic process. Teaching and learning are essential to the transmission of culture, while culture will influence what is taught and how, depending on the cultural, ethnographic and demographic make-up of the target audience. The paper concludes that if Caribbean development is to be enhanced in the twenty first century, then the teaching contents and methods of UWI faculty members and other educators in the region must be culturally relevant.

Key words: Capitalism, dialectics, curriculum, culture, postmodern, postmodernism, teaching.

INTRODUCTION

The importance of cultural relevance to any curriculum goes to the heart of the pedagogic process, the curricula of programmes in the department of management studies (DOMS) lack cultural relevance? How important to Caribbean development can the cultural relevance of an indigenous business curriculum be, within this globalized market environment? Other questions to be answered by educators in the contemporary Caribbean are:

- 1) What are the nuts and bolts of teaching in the 21st Century Caribbean?
- 2) Are our teachers equipped with 21st century tools? What are these tools?
- 3) What is the profile of the 21st century learner?
- 4) Can we transform this learner into a work ready graduate for the global organization?
- 5) What are the missing dialectics needed to complete

*Corresponding author. E-mail: orville.beckford@uwimona.edu.jm.

Author(s) agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

this process

Many universities in the Third World use huge amounts of literatures that are created and printed in developed countries. The production of textbooks and other academic tools are influenced by the capitalist mode of production and the accompanying cultural behavior associated with it. The emergence of an industrial society referred to as modernity was accompanied by modernism. Modernism referred to the culture that accompanied the period of industrial society arising in the 20th century. This period was called modernity or the modern society. The period of modernism, with its many elements such as new types of behaviour, created many factors that tertiary institutions management have to grapple with on a day-to-day basis:

- 1) Sagging profits
- 2) Dwindling students' enrolment
- 3) Increase demands from faculty members
- 4) Limited commitment from faculty members who are prepared to work-to-the-hours being paid for on a monthly basis
- 5) Increasing overhead costs.

So many of the factors are affected by capitalism in its many forms. Capitalism is the mode (or type) of production used in Western society. How business is organized for profit involves the exploitation of labor and capital for production efficiency and profit. This was the main modes of production being used, whether in a school, plant or service organization. The environment of our socialization and the realm within which we currently construct a cultural reality is not immune from the capitalist imperative of making a profit and the many social, political and economic superstructures which are shaped by this Marxist notion which was enunciated by Karl Marx (1818-1883) His philosophy saw the quest for high profitability by capitalist firms as involving exploitation of the worker class. The greater the exploitation, the higher the level of profit for the owners. Those who think that this period of new capitalism can be characterized as postmodern, also advocate the emergence of post-modernism as another form of capitalism.

POST-MODERNISM

Postmodernism is a very esoteric term with debaters on either side of the divide disagreeing as to whether we are really in the period of postmodernism. Some scholars define it as emerging with the rise/expansion of the internet. This system of connectivity that linked many computers in the United States army was made available to the public at large. With this period of the internet came a major shift in behaviour of humans and how they

interact with each other and the resulting culture. It affected all aspects of cultural life from literature, drama, communication, architecture, media, teaching, business, etc. The internet along with the electronic age created a different kind of culture as interaction now represents a lack of linear as well as more diversity in most social interaction in institutions. Teaching was not spared being affected by this emerging technology given the level of technology being used in the educational process. This period of postmodernism also influences educators and facilitators, to examine how colleges approach the teaching and learning process during this era while surviving economically. The teaching and learning process is forced to examine whether the behaviour of students in postmodernism requires different approaches in the teaching and learning process. The constructivist theory of Vygotsky (1962) is revisited and still holds currency as the student is again the focal point of education in this contemporary period.

The teaching and learning process is now much more complex within this post-modern era. The learning process is filled with different things that assist students in learning as there are other social issues sitting in the classroom with the lecturers and students. These teaching tools include: Language usage, gender, colourism, cultural differences, cosmopolitan student body, and the brighter-than-the teacher INTERNET.

In *The Empire Writes Back* (Ashcroft et al.,2002), the authors shows the importance of writing from within as a means of bridging the gap between the language variant of the English and the cultural difference brought to it by the post-colonial, which has been an area often ignored by Caribbean teachers/lecturers. Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin went on to explain that: "Thus the alterity in that metonymic juncture establishes a silence beyond which the cultural 'Otherness' of the text cannot be traversed by the colonial language". The use of language and language learning skills is one of the main areas in which post-colonial behaviour is manifested.

The Caribbean's diglossic language situation places the colonial language in a position of control which leads to issues of dominance, power, and the social construction of the 'other' as a point of validation of personhood. How are these hegemonic themes displayed by students in the postmodern classrooms? The classroom no longer represents places of dominance by the teacher/lecturer in postmodernism. The availability of electronic tablets in school may contribute to the situation being made worse.

The student-cantered classroom gives more perceptive room to the students to demand passivity on the part of the teacher in responding to cultural and demographic diversity of the student population. All types of learning styles and associated cultural behaviour had to be accommodated within the teaching and learning process.

The teacher is always on public display due to the

presence of social media on students' devices. These literally controls and dominate the teacher's reaction to various classroom behaviours. These electronic devices are hegemonic over the teachers' impulsive responses which would have been born out of years of teaching experience. This has become the nature of postmodernist behaviour where there is no meta-narrative, meta-discipline, dominant culture, codified behaviour as established by the institutions. Each day brings new decisions and sometimes uncomfortable behaviour for the teacher/lecturer.

Are teachers seeing it manifested in the colourism behaviour of bleaching? This is just one of the many identity complications that are deepened by the postmodernist behaviour of students. Bleaching is evident in many mixed population schools and institutions but the teacher would be best advised to leave this behaviour alone for fear of being ladled as racist, bias, misogynist and intemperate. The teacher can hold open but objective discussions on such issues but must avoid foisting his/her opinion on the students.

How does the teacher/educator deals with colonialism and cultural imperialism that are imported with texts and visual images from the developed country's social structure of where the texts originate? Here the teacher must be schooled in development theories and cultural studies to impose variety and appropriate cultural literature and ideology within the curriculum of the school. The curricula of the school/institution must reflect the people's history and culture for the students to benefit from dialogic of Vygotsky's constructivist approach to teaching.

The language of capitalism has become a whole new area of dialectics in contemporary society. Is it discussed in the business courses of the region's universities and community colleges? Have the colleges done justice to students of business and other programmes by the omission of this important set of dialectics. Fairclough (2013) noted the centrality of neo-liberalism which creates economic insecurity and stress for some developing and underdeveloped countries; coupled with the restrained emphasis on growth, intensification of the exploitation of labour as main areas of the new capitalism.

The implication of neo-liberalism for universities and colleges in the Caribbean is the influx of overseas institutions. They are now part of the competitive landscape of tertiary education. The advantage of these foreign educational institutions is their economic and imperialist might that is facilitated by Third World countries neo-colonial past. The flexibility of capitalism is not only confined to the full exploitation of markets, labour, governments and environmental resources for increased capital accumulation, but also to using/manipulating language as a discourse to sell its objectives and sway people's opinions in favour of new capitalism. These hegemonic manipulations of developing

countries economy is done via the international technical bureaucracies such as: The World Bank (IBRD), International Monetary Fund (IMF), and World Trade Organization (WTO). Caribbean universities and colleges now have to strategize as to how they can compete and with what segmentary focus.

According to Sennett (2006) on new capitalism:

One of the real achievements of modern society is to remove the opposition between mass and mental. Education institutions have improved standard of numeracy and literacy on a scale which the Victorians could not imagine; the skills economy still leave behind the majority, more finely the education system turns out large numbers of unemployed educated young people, at least unemployed in the domains for which they have trained."

He further noted that the economic machine of new capitalism can run profitable and efficiently with the use of an even smaller elite. Notice that the organizations that employ your graduates are seeking to do more with less human resources.

Technology and the use of the internet allow organizations to constantly restructure, re-engineer, and down size while increasing output and market share. Who are what is being exploited in the process? The student or the teacher, or both?

Literatures use in the classroom during this post-modern period seek to show the restructuring of the production process and profit accumulation as the capitalist went in search of new markets and products as the basis for exploitation. In this regards the lecturers' facilitators should interrogate the literatures in an effort to ascertain the extent to which they addressed certain questions from a Caribbean perspective. Some of these questions are: Has the mode(s) of teaching moved concomitantly with the changing mode of production and the ensuing cultural mode of production? Capitalism to new capitalism: Modernism to post modernism: How is knowledge defined in each era? Does the definition affect teaching at the UWI, Community Colleges or other tertiary institutions?

The works of Jean-Francois Lyotard (1984) and Giddens (1984) are very instructive in how knowledge is perceived in this period of new capitalism. Lyotard saw postmodernism as breaking away from modernism and in doing so resulted in a concomitant severing of how knowledge is constructed. Science was no longer seen as the standard knowledge by which all others were judged. The objectivity of the meta-narrative of scientific theories was now laid bare by Lyotard who questioned the language used in the various disciplines of sciences and their accompanying 'language game'. He drew on Jacques Derrida's deconstructionism to show how knowledge has changed from the structuralism approach of modernity and modernism to the condition whereby

there is no longer a reliance on the stability of language (Derrida, 1976). According to David Harvey, in discussing the conditions of postmodernity, drew on Derrida's deconstructionism as a way of understanding narratives in the contemporary period:

Deconstructionism views cultural life as intersecting "texts"; deconstructive cultural analysis is concerned with "reading" texts by deconstructing them or breaking down the narrative to show how it is composed of different textual elements and fragments (Thompson, 1996).

Lyotard (1984) sees the postmodern period as incredulity towards metanarratives. This now forces lecturers and curriculum developers in this postmodern period to examine how courses are taught and what is taught. How is knowledge perceived and used in the teaching of meta theories? Marxist/conflict, functionalism, Weber social action theory, Porter's five forces model and standard accounting principles among other theories of management are now questioned for stability and objectivity within the search for an etiology in new capitalism. In addition, the emergence of the technological era in modernity with its electronic mode of production has resulted in more fragmentation of language and even more accepted language games under new capitalism. The rise of the technicians with needed technical knowledge has found favour with the new capitalist who seeks to use the anti-essentialist property of technology for greater control, both in the workplace and the wider society.

Giddens added even more dialectics to how knowledge is constituted in the postmodern period. He also challenged the stability of positivists' orientation of science and the existence of dualism of society's influence and the individual passivity in contemporary society. Turner (1986) opined that Giddens is proposing more of a duality in which "people in interaction uses the rules and resources that constitutes social structures in their day-to-day routines in context of co-presence, and in so doing, they reproduce these rules and resources of structures" (Turner, 1986). He questioned the ideology of polar opposites used to explain certain social sciences theories such as Marxism and Functionalism. Both are macro sociological theories that give preeminence to the structure of society over the agency of individuals in determining their actions. Ritzer (1988) opined that Giddens saw structure not only as referring to large scale social structures but noted that "it can also refer to micro structures such as those involved in human interaction" (Ritzer, 1988). He went on further to quote Giddens in his structuration theory as saying that "Every research investigation in the social sciences or history is involved in relating action to (often used synonymously with *agency*) structure ... there is no sense in which structure 'determines' action or vice versa" (Ritzer, 1988).

This orientation of Giddens relates to knowledge in the contemporary period and how it is interrogated within the

dialectics of the class room. Here is espousing a duality of structure and agency which is similar to the behavior expected of those who design curricula for various programmes at the UWI and other tertiary institutions. Do they give agency to the students for whom the curricula are designed? Do they take into account that as the students and lecturers interact within the teaching and learning space, structure is developed? Students and lecturers interact with the rules and resources of the social structure. Hence, the need to have an approach to teaching that; pays special attention to the cultural space created in the teaching and learning process, the characteristics of all agents involved in the process and the hermeneutics of the learning environment within the Caribbean.

The new service industries of new capitalism create products which, according to Rutherford (2008), resulted in the "emergence of post materialist values associated with identity, ethics and belonging (Rutherford, 2008). Many goods and services are produced for differentiated consumers who all operate within a globalized environment of sameness amidst multiculturalism. The difference is tied to the economic production of similar but distinguished products appealing to our soft senses and peculiarity. Large numbers of these products which appeal to our emotions and 'difference' are in the service sector and cater to emerging demographic trends and consumer behaviors. The empirical data are retrieved from on-going research and development which has become a constant feature of the information society. Lankshear's discourse included aspects of contemporary organizational changes which are influenced by changes in the economic realm of production. Not many of the writers referenced in this work sought to explain the accompanying organizational changes which are spawned by changes in the productive system and the social relations emanating from these changes.

Lankshear also opined that discourse about educational reform is linked to themes in the discourse on new capitalism (Lankshear and Knobel, 2012). This is not surprising, given the social relations link between capitalism and education. Macionis and Plummer noted that, for Marx, the economy (money and capital) which forms the infrastructure of society determines the superstructure of social institutions, values and behavior of society (Macionis and Plummer, 2008). In other words, "social institutions reinforce the domination of the capitalists, by legally protecting their wealth..." (Macionis and Plummer, 2008) In extending this argument to education, it can be concluded that the education system would support a capitalist system of education. As the system of production changes and restructures itself, a concomitant change to the education system would evolve reflecting and accommodating these requisite changes.

Hence, there are no surprises to see changes in the language of new capitalism. This is in keeping with the

process by which the capitalist class gets compliance for the wider society. Their use of capital and power to influence the polity ensures that changes within the social system that will benefit them can be initiated and enforced by the polity. The use of capital and its associated power can be used to gain acquiescence of the masses in society. These masses are socialized by the educational system in the process of value consensus. Consequently, compliance to dictates of new capitalism will be done via language and education.

In Martin and McIntyre, Danielle Little questions whether this behavioral patterns at the macro level, as espoused by Marxists, stand in need of micro level explanations (Martin and McIntyre, 1994). In other words, should we assume that the macro level of society, such as the economy, affects the behavioral pattern of individuals without some discourse on what is happening at the micro (individual) level? Little opined that:

Some Marxist thinkers have argued that macro explanations stand in need of micro foundations, detailed accounts of the pathways by which macro-level social patterns come about. These theorists have held that it is necessary to provide an account of the circumstances of individual choice and action that gave rise to aggregate patterns if macro explanations are to be adequate. Thus, in order to explain the policies of the capitalist state, it is insufficient to observe that this state tends to serve capitalist interest: we need to have an account of the processes through which state policies are shaped or controlled so as to produce this outcome (Martin and McIntyre, 1994).

This is valid criticism by Little (1994), who sought to show the importance of the micro-sociological analysis. It is important to take into account the part played by individuals in directing their own behaviour. Max Weber, in Macionis and Plummer, pointed to this theoretical perspective long ago in his sociological 'social action perspective' (Macionis and Plummer, 2008). Individual situations should be analyzed to understand reasons behind their actions. This proves a bit difficult for some theorists of new capitalism. The overarching nature of capitalism as a dominant mode of production has led them to exclude any analysis of individual actions in response to capitalism. This is in keeping with macro-sociological analyses that focus on the wider society as the unit of analysis. Both Marx and Durkheim were categorized as macro sociological theorists due to their top-down approach to the study of society. Marx saw the economy as being central to the behaviour, values, and social institutions of the wider society.

While, Durkheim opined that it is through socialization and adherence to 'social facts' (rules, regulations, laws) that the society develops value consensus (Gaspard-Richards et al., 2005). Marxists and neo-Marxist theorists would explain the language of new capitalism using Marx's material determinism approach. The fact that

human beings have to purchase material things to survive means that their actions will be driven/determined by the economy.

The above arguments then lead us to conclude that the language of capitalism may be seen from different perspectives by individuals in society. Different individuals may have noted the appearance of new words and phrases in the everyday English vocabulary. Some individuals may not have noticed or attached any importance to these words or phrases as part of a large process of new capitalism to get acquiescence to the ideology of constant capital accumulation. Post-industrial society has seen the introduction of new phraseologies associated with business, as noted by Lankshear. Some of these new terms mentioned by Lankshear, that are now popular in the language of new capitalism are; profit-driven, cost effective, lean and mean, focused on the bottom line, value adding, competitive edge, efficient rationalized, and committed to 'uniform standards across all sites of activity'. Human beings are cultural beings and any attempt to teach/change behaviour in students should take into account both the culture of the students and their surrounding environment. How applicable and practical is this ideology to the teaching and learning process of business related curricula in a cosmopolitan Caribbean? Beckford (Levitt, 2000), in speaking about the importance of social knowledge, opines that "...we should be concerned essentially with the evolution of ideas and the ways in which this evolution influences peoples' perception of their lives and the future of themselves and their societies" (236).

There appears to be a lacuna in curriculum design and research whose objectives are focused on the effectiveness of departments at UWI (University of the West Indies) making their programmes culturally relevant in fulfilling the mandate of the institution. Is there a link between cultural relevance and adequate preparation for the world of work? The researcher has not been able to unearth any study linking cultural relevance to the 'readiness for work' of UWI students. Also, how important is this cultural link to the adequate development of UWI students for the 21st century Caribbean? The enduring Mission of the UWI is:

To advance education and create knowledge through excellence in teaching, research, innovation, public service, intellectual leadership and outreach in order to support the inclusive (social, economic, political, cultural, environmental) development of the Caribbean region and beyond. This mission points to the major objective of the UWI which is to so structure its teaching and learning resources "in order to support the inclusive (social, economic, political, cultural, environmental) development of the Caribbean region and beyond"¹. Reflectively the question lingers as to how then, can the structuring of the

¹Taken from the University of the West Indies' (UWI) Strategic Plan 2012 – 2017

teaching and learning resources be done appropriately to support the many types of development in the Caribbean, without a culturally relevant curriculum? Nettleford also supported the need for culturally relevant education by conceptualizing and contextualizing some of “the recurring themes/concerns/issues” of the region as it entered the new millennium (Inward Stretch Outward Reach vii-ix). He noted that: Firstly, for the region to have safe entry into the 21st century, there is the urgent need for an expansion of thought rooted in the Caribbean’s historical experience and existential reality and responsive to the unpredictability of rapid change at the end of the century... Fourthly, issues of cultural identity, employment, productivity and the pressing demands for an expanded science-and-technology capability suggest an urgent need for the rational indigenization of an articulated Caribbean educational system at all levels of operation (vii-viii).

The indigenization of the educational system at all levels was Nettleford’s perception of what would be required by the Caribbean if it is to carve out a survival strategy within the 21st century. The survival of the Caribbean’s identity within globalisation is dependent on how the region educates its tertiary-level students about its culture. In fact, Nettleford (1999) alluded to the need for the people of the region to “create mental structures” with “structural products” of “music, dance, religious expressions, language, literature, appropriate designs for social living” in order for the Caribbean to deal with the challenges of globalization which he described as “the harmonization of inner and outer space” (Inward Stretch Outward Reach 83-84). This meeting of inner and outer spaces exposed the need for the Caribbean people to be properly educated about their culture in all spheres of education so as to create that indelible sense of self and identity formation that can withstand the hegemonic forces, which historically comes from the outer space, during the integration process of globalization. This cultural identity is also needed in such an important area as business education to drive part of the developmental objectives in the Caribbean. The economic domination by the outer space remains a clear and present danger to Caribbean survival and identity. The use of indigenous businesses and a concomitant focus on Caribbean cultural education become part of the region’s measured response to the global threat of social, cultural and economic domination. If left unheeded, this threat will perpetuate the economic dependency of countries in the region. Porter (2000) noted that after substantial analysis of various nations, states, and companies “the question is not whether culture has a role but how to understand this role in the context of the broader determinants of prosperity” (14). The role of culture is important to determining how the students of the DOMS construct their perception of Caribbean prosperity. They might want to contemplate the problematique of whether there is/can be a Caribbean prosperity and what the implications to their individual prosperity are, within a globalized

Caribbean.

One of the weaknesses² identified in the UWI’s strategic plan 2012-2017 is: Work-readiness of graduates. This area of deficiency is perceived as one of the necessary pillars of university reform in Latin America and the Caribbean by Rivera quoted in a UNESCO publication about higher education in the 21st century. She noted that:

Today there is an evident division between the university world and the world of action. The labour world, that of public administration, the business world, are at present very distant from the world of formal higher education and each of them seems to be locked in narrow limits and different logics (Rivera, 1998:163).

Rivera (Lucky, 2011) went on to stress the need for universities in Latin America and the Caribbean region to understand the differences between the two worlds in an effort to deal with the challenges of development in the present era (163). It is possible that central to the integration of the two worlds is the need for students to understand the culture of the environment called ‘work’ in which they will be pushed for their own economic survival. The problem can be circumnavigated by instilling culture within the university’s curricula to ensure that students have practical and applicable knowledge of the work environment before engagement with this very cultural space.

This area of the UWI strategic plan which links teaching and learning to the world of work must be supported by all the faculties and departments which are engaged in the teaching and learning process, whether directly or as support staff.

The cultural relevance of programme curricula would assist in the accomplishment of this endeavor. Having DOMS curricula that are culture-focused would contribute immensely to the adequate preparation of students, who become graduates that are ready for the world of work. Work-readiness of the UWI graduates is one of the true tests of the effectiveness of the teaching and learning process in the DOMS and by extension the university’s academic, technical, administrative and technological systems. Hence, the need for research into cultural relevance of the DOMS programmes could be a starting point for the overall evaluation of other programmes at the UWI.

Businesses in the Caribbean are involved in global competition for the production and marketing of their goods and services. But can they prepare for global competition without first knowing their local market and its culture? Lucky³ noted that, “Thus, the great lesson of the last half of the twentieth century is that the values, beliefs

²Taken from the University of the West Indies’ (UWI) Strategic Plan 2012 – 2017

Esuh Ossai-Igwe Lucky was discussing practical approaches to nurturing entrepreneurship development in the 21st Century.

and practices embodied in a nation's culture are not only an important productive resource, but often the most important resource" (221). This frame of reference which ranks culture as the most important resource is necessary for ensuring the cultural relevance of a business programme. If the students have no cultural frame of reference within which to understand the material being taught, how practically relevant will be the curriculum in the teaching and learning process? Can they relate what is being taught and the examples used to their own cultural realities? The pervasive use of texts produced in other cultural jurisdiction compound the need for the students to have their own cultural frame of reference as a tool of analysis and intervention. The practicality of this approach to curriculum design can be seen by exploring some questions related to how the marketing of goods and services would be considered in a number of courses within business curricula in the DOMS.

Questions that require careful thought as part of any long-term business plan of a local or regional firm would include:

- 1) Who are our customers?
- 2) How often and where do they buy our products?
- 3) What do they expect of our products?
- 4) Are there differences between local and international consumers of our products and services?
- 5) Who are our competitors, and how do they behave locally, regionally and internationally?

Students graduating from any business programmes at the UWI or other tertiary institutions in the English-speaking Caribbean should be in a position to answer all of the preceding questions for any potential business in which they are employed. In fact, such questions could be asked at different stages of a recruitment process for new managers or marketing technicians.

GLOBALIZATION

The multiculturalism of globalization does not obviate the need for further cultural relevance of an indigenous programme from small regions like the Caribbean. The region's culture has not disappeared with the advent of contemporary globalization. It is still needed as a base from which to negotiate the international competitive environment. While no one can escape the consequences of globalization as Barker (2005) noted, "We remain unequal participants and globalization remains an unequal process" (175). The strength of the region's response to globalisation will depend, in part, on the quality of the UWI graduates and their ability to see the relevance of culture not only in their curricula but also as the basis for regional integration and success.

Globalisation has been defined by Benn as "the increase integration of trade, production and finance

across national boundaries" (Benn, 2000: 23). Entwined within this definition are many social and cultural issues of power, dominance/hegemony, colonialism, dependency and imperialism - just to name a few dialectics associated with a commonly used term in business. The term globalisation is constructed differently by people in disparate nation states. Hall, quoted in Barker, argues that "diasporic identities are constructed within and by cultural power" (Barker, 2005:175). The Caribbean is described as a diasporic region with people from many different Diasporas historically meeting in the Caribbean (Campbell 120). The cultures of the different diasporic groups are suggested by Hall to be the power behind identity formations. Here, Hall is raising culture to the point of relevance in the construction of identities. Discussion about markets and customers must unavoidably incorporate notions of culture as being central to identifying individuals or groups of like-minded individuals.

Skills are required in the curriculum design for the DOMS to ensure that the understanding of cultural relevance in all aspects of their programmes is not inchoate. If little or no attempt is made to cement the Caribbean's culture in the cognitive psyche of the students of the Department of Management Studies (DOMS) then the concept of a Caribbean identity will soon be lost forever as Caribbean cultural sovereignty is surrendered along with political sovereignty in the demands of contemporary globalization. Porter, however, provides a more optimistic future outlook for the benefits of globalisation by pointing to the need for countries to pay attention to those industries that produce goods and services "in which their culture gives them a unique advantage". The Caribbean's culture is known and admired worldwide, but not enough use is made of the many cultural industries in crafting sustainable development plans, programmes and policies. Porter⁴ further concluded that:

Thus, although global convergence around the productivity paradigm is increasing, cultural differences will certainly remain. Globalisation will not eradicate culture, as some have feared. However, instead of isolating some people in their economic disadvantage, these cultural differences can contribute the special advantage so important to improving the prosperity of nations in the global economy. In a global economy in which so many things can be easily sourced from anywhere, cultural differences that give rise to distinctive products and services should become more celebrated. (28).

This argument by Porter had been put forward by Nettleford (2003), many years before. The general

⁴Porter's publications are frequently used at both the graduate and undergraduate levels in the DOMS which is now part of Mona School of Business and Management (MSBM.)

philosophy of this perdurable thinking by Nettleford and Porter derives from an epistemological background in which culture is treated as a necessary tool for teaching and learning. In fact, cultural dialectics embedded within universities curricula is the *sine qua non* for the way forward in the contemporary period for small regions and states like those of the Caribbean (Nettleford, 1997).

The social sciences provide critical analysis of social life's most important questions and concerns. These concerns vary from 'why am I poor' to questioning whether Marx's theory of economic determinism (Macionis and Plummer, 2008)⁵ can apply to the Caribbean or to my business. The social scientist will not always provide a definitive answer to this and other epistemic concerns of society, but he/she should provide the dialogic or sow the seed of thought-formation to enable the ordinary folk to start pondering his/her own answers to such perplexing questions. In doing this, the social scientist is utilizing the culture of the individual as part of the solution to questions. The individual's critical response would be a product of his/her perception and experiences if we are to assume that Piaget (1959, 1968)⁶, as referred to by Merriam, Caffarella and Baumgartner, is correct about human perception in learning theories (Merriam et al., 2007: 285).

CONCLUSION

Lev Vygotsky's constructivist approach seems quite appropriate to the art of teaching and learning at the tertiary level in this cosmopolitan twenty first century Caribbean. Vygotsky's theory can and should be assimilated to the UWI and other tertiary institutions curricula. The relevance of Vygotsky's 'zone of proximal development (ZPD) to teaching and learning in the Caribbean comes from an approach to teaching and learning in which integration for learning means development for both learner and facilitator. The zone of proximal development starts with collaboration for learning and has been defined as "the distance between the actual developmental level as determined by independent problem solving and the level of potential development as determined through problem solving under adult guidance, or in collaboration with more capable peers". This approach is in contradistinction to the one way 'chalk and talk' which structures the learner to wait on instructions to develop ideas. Vygotsky also indicated that "what is in the zone of proximal development today will be the actual developmental level tomorrow". In the Vygotskian approach, instructional strategies used to scaffold include (but are not limited to)

⁵Macionis and Plummer discussed this concept as part of the philosophy of Karl Marx in which the economy forms the base of society or infrastructure, which then creates a superstructure of values and beliefs systems (102-103).

⁶Piaget proposed a four stage theory showing how human learning starts with mental processes. He went on to show how mental development precedes learning.

hints, prompts, and cues given and later removed by the lecturer. Scaffolding can also involve orchestrating social contexts known to support student's learning, such as make-believe play or specifically designed group activities. This ideology of education pulls the lecturer into the teaching and learning process for greater use of strategies that are culturally relevant and suitable for the cosmopolitan student body that is currently at the UWI.

Vygotsky's social constructivist view of education and curricula incorporates the multi-cultural nature of modern society as well as the many factors (internally and externally) that determine the final outcome from the teaching and learning process- a work ready graduate from the UWI. Students play an active part in the teaching and learning process as lecturers collaborate with students to facilitate meaning constructions and develop the environment for cultural mediation for better understanding and outcome of the pedagogic process. Cultural development of the individual is the apogee for Vygotsky and should be assimilated to UWI strategic objective to prepare work-ready graduates.

The tertiary level classroom of the twenty first century has a wide mix of students for whom meanings are created in various ways. The creation of meaning stems from past experiences, cultural meanings, cultural images, perceptions, activities and many other sources. The lecturer facilitator must play the role of cultural worker (Freire, 2005). Donalddo Macedo and Ana Maria Araujo Freire noted that Paulo Freire opines that "A humanizing education is the path through which men and women can become conscious about their presence in the world." (Macedo et al, 2005; Freire, 1998).

Teaching in the twenty first century requires educators who are interested in seeing their students as social beings from diverse backgrounds and culture.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES

- Ashcroft B, Griffiths G, Tiffin H (2002). *The empire writes back* (2nd edition). Routledge.
- Barker C (2005). *Cultural Studies: Theory and Practice*. 2nd. London: Sage Publication.
- Benn D (2000). "Globalization and the North-South Divide. "Globalization a Calculus of Inequality: Perspectives from the South. Eds. Kenneth Hall and Denis Benn. Kingston: Ian Randle Publishers.
- Derrida J (1976). *Of Grammatology*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Fairclough N (2013). *Critical discourse analysis in researching language in the new capitalism: Overdetermination, transdisciplinarity and textual analysis*. In *Critical Discourse Analysis*. Routledge, pp. 281-300.
- Freire P (1998). *Teachers as Cultural Workers. Letters to Those Who Dare to Teach*. *The International Journal of Educational Management* 12(4):189-189.
- Freire P (2005). *Pedagogy of the oppressed/Paulo Freire*. New York.- London: Continuum.

- Gaspard-Richards DD, Vashti D, Bennie B (2005). *Social Sciences Course Material: Introduction to Sociology SOC11002[SY14G]*. Bridgetown, Barbados: The University of the West Indies Open Campus.
- Giddens A (1984). *The constitution of society: Outline of the theory of structuration*. University of California Press.
- Lankshear C, Knobel M (2012). "Steps Towards Pedagogy of Practice." Keynote Paper Prepared for the National Council of English Teachers Assembly for Research Mid-Winter Conference. New York: n.p., 202:1-23. Web. 6 July 2012.
- Levitt K (2000). *The George Beckford Papers*. Kingston: Canoe Press, Print.
- Little D (1994). "Microfoundations of Marxism." *Readings in the Philosophy of Social Sciences*. Eds. Michael Martin and Lee C. McIntyre. Cambridge, Ma: MIT Press. Print.
- Lucky EO (2011). "Nurturing Entrepreneurship Development in the 21st Century: The Practical Approaches." *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 1(9):219-227. Web 24 November 2013 <http://www.ijhssnet.com>
- Lyotard JF (1984). *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press. Print.
- Macedo D, Ana M, Araujo F (2005). Foreword. *Teachers as Cultural Workers: Letters to Those Who Dare Teach*. Paulo Freire. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 2005. vii-xxvi. Print.
- Macionis J, Plummer K (2008). *Sociology: A Global Introduction*. 4th. Essex: Pearson Education, Print.
- Martin M, McIntyre LC (eds.) (1994). *Readings in the Philosophy of Social Sciences*. Cambridge, Ma: MIT Press, Print.
- Merriam SB, Caffarella RS, Baumgartner LM (2007). *Learning in Adulthood* 3rd Ed. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Company pp. 275-297.
- Nettleford RM (1997). Continuing Battle for Space – the Caribbean Challenge. *Caribbean Quarterly* 43(1-2):90-95.
- Nettleford RM (1999). *Inward Stretch Outward Reach: A Voice from the Caribbean*. London and Basingstoke: The Macmillan Press.
- Nettleford RM (2003). *Caribbean Cultural Identity: The Case of Jamaica. An Essay in Cultural Dynamics*. Kingston: Ian Randle Publishers.
- Piaget J (1968). *Six Psychological Studies*. Trans. Anita Tenzer. New York: Vintage Books.
- Piaget J (1959). *The language and Thought of the Child*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1959 (1923): Print.
- Porter M (2000). "Attitudes, Values, Beliefs, and the Microeconomics of Prosperity." *Culture Matters: How Values Shape Human Progress*. Ed. Lawrence E Harrison and Samuel P. Huntington. New York: Basic Books.
- Ritzer G (1988). *Contemporary Sociological Theory* 3rd edition. New York: McGraw Hill Incorporated. 1988:427-456. Print.
- Rivera M (1998) "Graduate as Soon as Possible, to Learn Outside." *Higher Education in the XXI Century View of Latin America and the Caribbean*. Volume 1. Documents of the Regional Conference Policies and Strategies for the Transformation of Higher Education in Latin America and the Caribbean held in Havana, Cuba, from 18-22 November 1996. Caracas: CRESALC/UNESCO, 1998:157-174: Print.
- Rutherford J (2008). "The Culture of Capitalism." *Soundings* 38:8-18.
- Sennett R (2006). *The Culture of the New Capitalism*. New Haven: Yale University Press pp. 85-86.
- Thompson D (1996). "Postmodernism," *Modernity: An Introduction to Modern Societies*, Stuart Hall. Et. Al Eds. Blackwell: London. P 570.
- Turner J (1986). *The Structure of Sociological Theory* 4th edition. Chicago: The Dorsey Press.
- University of the West Indies' (UWI) Strategic Plan 2012 - 2017. <https://uwi.edu/uop/sites/uop/files/UWI%20Strategic%20Plan%202012-2017.pdf>
- Vygotsky LS (1962). *Thought and Language*. Cambridge MA: MIT Press. Print.

Full Length Research Paper

Intersections of everyday routines of Muslim women academicians' during Covid-19

Emel Topçu and Serap Fišo*

Social and Political Sciences Department, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, International University of Sarajevo (IUS), Hrasnička cesta 15, 71210 Ilidža, Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Received 9 November, 2022; Accepted 16 December, 2022

This paper aims to expand and investigate the existing intersection parameters of daily life rituals in seven Muslim women's academician public and private spheres by including alternative theoretical perspectives of COVID-19 social isolation phenomena that have not been socially explored before. Autoethnography is the methodology applied to answer how and to what extent these intersections have affected living space, time, and tools. The study has revealed a significant intersection of women-related obligations in the public sphere with private sphere responsibilities affected by COVID-19. Moreover, the study re-evaluated the existing literature on the public and private sphere, female gender, especially related to the concepts of discipline, surveillance, and self-censorship. Finally, it has revealed possible intersectionality relations to the metaphors of post-traumatic experiences of these seven Muslim academicians.

Key words: COVID-19, Muslim female academician, public/private sphere, Foucault, autoethnography.

INTRODUCTION

Undoubtedly unexpected, COVID-19 hit the political, economic, social and health life of the world in 2020 with its life-threatening consequences. COVID-19 showed its impact on countries like Bosnia and Herzegovina and Turkey almost simultaneously in March (Euronews, 2020). In view of the current situation surrounding the global outbreak of the coronavirus, most educational institutions have decided to gradually switch to online teaching while complying with the official curfews. In order to create this quick unplanned order, scholars began to work on all of these academic requirements, but gender inequality became an important yardstick for academic requirements. Recent publications on the

challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic by gender underscore that COVID-19 has led to unprecedented closures of daycare centers, schools and workplaces, reflecting the challenges in the areas of disclosure, teaching and tightened administrative requirements. The data in the article shows that women are spending more time on childcare and homeschooling than men during the pandemic (Gabster et al., 2020). This study was therefore designed at the earliest stage of the pandemic to provide scholarly insights from a group of Muslim women who suspected some exclusion and unconscious possibilities of prejudice and who had already experienced diverse challenges in the male-dominated

*Corresponding author. E-mail: sfiso@ius.edu.ba. Tel: 0038762725055.

institutional culture. Women in their meetings, inquire into the question of this invisible wall 'where the public sphere begins and ends, where private sphere begins and ends' (Costa, 1995:7-16). The main research question of the article seeks an answer to what extend these seven Muslim women academicians experience significant overlap in their public/private spheres.

Although as academics, have seen the indisputable fact that the COVID-19 process has burdened women with more responsibilities in the private sphere, and although their production responsibilities have peaked, according to a Washington Post blog report, a parallel to the Institute's report of the Fiscal policy reveals a dramatic gap in the division of domestic responsibilities between the sexes: childcare and housework responsibilities are mainly assumed by mothers, who spend 10.3 h a day (2.3 h more than fathers) and 1.7 h more housework than fathers spend (Andrew et al., 2020). Although this quarantine brought no immediate change in our lives, we were able to talk and question the issues encountered on the platform to censor and shape some facts and views from the perspective of intersections in the private/public sphere in terms of time, space and tools. In modern postmodern societies, Nowotny et al. (2003:179-194) argue that the boundaries between private and public spheres of science have merged and the two strands are now co-produced as a slogan that women are oppressed not only because of the capitalist, modern order, but also because of the patriarchal structure enforcing private sphere.

When all these consequences of the pandemic were analyzed from the perspective of women's studies, the first finding was that our traditional husbands, mostly religious husbands, under pressure from society, have not contributed to many private duties. Most of the intersectionality is primarily experienced between her two accomplished roles: being mother and academic and wife and academic. As Doucet (1996) points out, women do most of the housework in the private sphere, although they are socially active and productive in the public sphere. Researchers in this study emphasized that they either hated or were fed up with asking for task-sharing, and our expectations of our husbands began to change during this lockdown. The idea of this research structured, in particular, an examination of Habermas' analysis of public research along with Foucault's discipline might contribute partly to understanding how the mechanisms of surveillance and self-censorship impact the daily life of women academicians with these types of life requirements (Habermas, 1974; Foucault, 1979).

Most of the intersectionality is primarily experienced between her two accomplished roles: being a mother and academic and a wife and academic. Unexpected results were shared and reflected during their online lectures, disturbed by their children or husbands. This made them appear unprofessional in public. On the other hand, the

working time as an academic in the public sphere was indirectly lengthened by the expectations of members of private life and their responsibilities as a wife and mother. Additionally, our own experiences and research during COVID-19 as research co-authors will add to the richness of autoethnographic stories and literature about the dramatic global pandemic of the 21st century.

METHODOLOGY: AUTOETHNOGRAPHY OF SEVEN MUSLIM ACADEMICIANS

An autoethnographic methodology, which newly and extensively begins to apply in scientific publication. It is a research method that helps researchers to self-observe, reflect, think about, understand, and interpret our experiences for ourselves (Wall, 2006: 146-160). The analysis methodology of autoethnography is based on reliability and usability as essential conditions for the collection of empirical material. These seven female academics as researchers from the discipline of management, and natural science found autoethnography as the unrelenting impetus of the world of traditional science with a wonderful, symbolic, and emancipatory promise for the implementation of the empirical materials of the research. Their autoethnographic diary in the online encounter in the private/public sphere reflected the daily observation of their everyday life, and the demand. As these seven Muslim academics are personally experiencing the limitations of the pandemic, they have recognized the importance of using introspection of autoethnography as a source of empirical material on COVID-19 (Bochner and Ellis, 2016; Ellis, 2016).

As a member and leader of the group, Prof. Topcu recognized early on the lack of research studies on the pandemic in all areas of life. At that moment, she decided to specifically select seven female academics from different places to start a project called Korona Akademisyenleri and bring them all together in a Whatsapp group on March 30 at 21:17.

This selection was based on gender, occupation, religion, language and experience of exclusion (unconsciously or consciously biased) from the public sphere.

All participants speak Turkish and come from Gaziantep, Sanlurfa, Mardin, Elazig (Turkey), and Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina). All have international experience from India, Germany, Austria, the USA, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and other parts of the world. Six of them have children, four of them are married and their spouses work, one of them is single and lives with her sister, and two continue their lives as single managers. After explaining the purpose of the project and reasons for joining the group, all members decided to hold the first meeting on April 1st, Wednesday, at 17.00h. for Turkey and at 16.00h. for Bosnia and Herzegovina. These seven academics met twice a week, Mondays and Wednesdays, via a visual online meeting platform and began the process of collecting empirical material with long, unstructured discussions about how and in what ways the COVID-19 process affected their lives influenced. An autoethnography relates to both the process and what emerges from the process because in the process these women not only produced a scientific product but also formed friendships: these quarantine days meetings became activities and encounters with each other (Bochner and Ellis, 2016; Ellis, 2004:32). All of the scientific bodies of autoethnographic methodology mentioned in this part of the research contributed their unique, profound criteria for the significant and correct application of the method in such social factors.

The research becomes a transformative perspective with its unique method of autoethnography (Creswell and Creswell 2017:64). The hermeneutic circle model (Bochner and Ellis, 2016) applied to the analysis of the empirical material expresses the

concern of experimental writings by confronting the conditions of representation and subjectivity.

Because it allows for the interpretation of textual data transcribed based on the experience of research participants and comprehensively provides space to underpin the meaning of daily life, human practice and cultures with philosophical possibilities. The participants, with the exception of the authors of the article, are coded with a pseudonym. Table 1 shows the distribution of participants.

FINDINGS

The auto-ethnographic findings revealed the experiences of the COVID-19 pandemic in terms of time, space and tools of seven female Muslim academics and confirmed significant intersectionality in their private/public spheres.

Intersection in space in the private and public sphere

This part of the study discussed the intersections in the private sphere such as housing and answered the following questions: How did the size of a house affect the process? What was the actual effect of marriage and having children on women in this social quarantine process in the private sphere? What has put women under the most pressure in the private sphere as modern women who belong to the public sphere? Where should we have moved our office and which spatial elements strengthened our sense of belonging to the public space? Although participants experienced participation in online sessions of conferences worldwide as an inevitable fact that their productivity peaked in this process of social isolation, they also experienced reduced functionality as a representative of women in the public space after being brought into the private space. In this part, the intersection process in relation to the living space is presented using the precise thoughts of the participants. Those of us who lived in smaller neighborhoods and had children were more affected by this intersection process. On the other hand, the bachelorette continued to maintain her privacy by creating the public in the home and enjoyed the functionality of the public and continued to produce in her public.

Metaphoric reflection of private sphere: Is it a home or a graveyard or the belly of a great fish?

In this part, the focus is on analyzing both the emotional and metaphorical implications of the stay-at-home aspect from the perspective of the research participants. Participants affirmed that we as females were afraid of staying at home or privacy in this modern age, but *'this unexpectedly became a revision process in our lives'* (Gupte, April 1st, 2020 - 1:05:35 min.). 'We were happy to be in privacy until this process stopped being temporary and our worries, even our fears and nightmares of being

locked at home started resonating in our heads. Because of the social quarantine, we began metaphorically comparing our homes to some well-known religious concepts, such as a tomb and the belly of a big fish; *'this process reminded me of life in a grave, which has no temporal and spatial coordinates'* (Elzem, April 8th, 2020). Alternatively, we have revised our relationship to the Quran (the holy book of Islam) and our religion by finding a connection to the Prophet Jonah: *'Our impatient state of being at home reminds me of Jonah's impatient state in the belly of a big fish and his prayer to Allah'* (Didem, May 10th, 2020 - 2:09:16 min.). Other important independent variables in this process are the size of our homes and marital status. The small apartments and houses caused the participants some concerns about an organization with other household members: *'In Bosnia, our houses and our living quarters are not suitable for a full-day stay at home with two or three children due to their small size. I had to bring my things home from my office. Now I don't have enough space to store them'* (Elzem, April 6th, 2020 - 22:26 min.). However, participants living in larger houses did not experience as much intersectionality in terms of house size and chores. *'Aside from setting up my workplace in the house, we set up a room with a desk for my sister to give her a sense of belonging'* (Zumra, April 6th, 2020 - 75:35 min.). Some of the participants considered spending their time with their loved ones, regardless of the size and conditions of the available space: *'even if the size of the house in Bosnia and Koycegiz is more appropriate for this process, the house in Ankara is where I prefer with my son than alone in other houses'* (Emel, April 6th, 2020 - 8:00 min.).

Lecturer in the classroom in public sphere and mother in private sphere

Taking into account the demands of public and private sphere, spatial overlaps reach our limits in special situations like preparing our classes when our children and husbands are at home. When our kids needed space to draw with crayons, we looked for a convenient place, like the ironing board or the kitchen counter, to put our laptop down and prepare for a lecture. In addition, children, being part of the house rhythm, became one of the most dynamic rhythmic elements of the routines that intersect the public space with the quarantine process: *'children are best suited to transform the space because children spontaneously use their physicality to everyday life by teasing the other members who are at their home, and this creates an opportunity to observe the transformative power of the children on site'* (Gupse, April 6th, 2020, 65:00 min.). One participant mentioned that not only academics in modern times are behaving as if they have unlimited time and space, or not only adults but also children are inexorably behaving as if they are being held by a *büvelek* (warble-fly): *'In the modern In life we rush everywhere like a horse that is held by a büvelek*

Table 1. Distribution of participants.

<i>Participant's code</i>	<i>Country/city</i>	<i>Number of children</i>	<i>Living space size (approx.)</i>	<i>Period for observing intersections (approx.)</i>
Emel	TR-BiH/Ankara-Sarajevo	2	More than 100m ²	Since March 2020
Tahire	TR/Gaziantep	2	300m ²	Since March 2020
Elzem	BiH/Sarajevo	3	Less than 100m ²	Since March 2020
Zumra	TR/Elazig	-	More than 100m ²	Since March 2020
Gupse	TR/Sanlıurfa	1	More than 100m ²	Since March 2020
Didem	TR/Mardin	1	More than 100m ²	Since March 2020
Serap	BiH/Sarajevo	2	49m ²	Since March 2020

Source: Author

while we play our roles... we got locked up, we stopped, got rid of bvelek and started to make sense of many things' (Elzem, April 22nd, 2020).

At the beginning of the epidemic, the situation looked like this. We have tried to engage as much as possible with all the activities around us.

The participants with children admitted that their children and husbands turned out to be their observation variables in order to understand this process. The life of these mothers looks like the life of a horse that is caught by a warble-fly and constantly produces activities for their children.

'Because children are used to spending time with their parents playing rather than learning through play, there has been a large overlap between their parents' work hours and their habits as their parents struggle to meet the needs of public space. Most of us have similar experiences with our children growing up: my daughter always wants to do something, for example she wants to play games without a break. She has no tolerance for adult fatigue. She also doesn't stop when I tell her I'm tired. She offers an alternative, like painting while we can both sit' (Didem, May10th, 2020 - 2:07:36 min.).

Some of us took advantage of technology to stay

in control of the kids during our online classes: *'We live in a two room apartment (originally it was 1.5 rooms), my concern is how I want privacy and can protect my duty as a mother and technology? Especially in class, when children appear in front of the camera, I feel unprofessional' (Serap, April 6th, 2020 - 37:07 min.).*

Although one of the hottest topics, especially in times of the pandemic, is the question of the compatibility of work and child-rearing mothers, the discussion was included the study.

Views the public sphere over the balconies and windows of the private sphere

In the process of social isolation in our lives, balconies and windows have acquired a different meaning than spaces that give us access to the public: *'we need to be aware that it is a time when we need to think about our space practices' (Gupse, April 19th, 2020 - 10:00 min.).*

For most of us, balconies became places for our sociology students to do their homework and, above all, areas of research for us: from my window and balcony I watch the people of the city at the traditional Sunday barbecue. In the second week (after the social quarantine), the neighbors decided to move their barbecue party from the

picnic area to the balcony. I understood the situation: *'the way we use space is changing now; this is a serious transformation of our spatial practice' (Gupse, April 19th, 2020 - 10:00 min.).* In public we had a producer feeling, but privately we live in a part of the world where we watched a party from the window and balcony.

From time to time, balconies turned into places where we applauded healthcare providers or turned to a place where we picked up a token of our freedom. Our balconies and windows allow for images outside of where we live: sometimes it was the view of the setting sun, sometimes it was the blossoming trees with the joy of spring that our frames could have captured. Balconies transformed into playgrounds for children to communicate with their friends or an area not considered to be cleaned until the social quarantine:

...the windows on this balcony had not been washed for at least six months; I realized that there are too many windows on the balcony... Meanwhile, the next-door neighbor turned her chair towards us and sat down on the balcony. My sister and I tried to guess what she might have thought, and as a typical cleaning-loving woman who would be happy to see us could have thought - Wow, they finally got on cleaning

those windows (Zumra, April 19th, 2020 - 30:00 min.).

No matter what we observed, no matter what we felt, we were once again grateful to our Creator for having homes with balconies that allow us gradual emotional transitions. A member of our group who was caught by COVID-19 underscored the importance of a balcony: *'Yesterday my students came with their parents. We greeted each other from the balcony. We waved. It was very emotional'* (Zumra, November 24th, 2020 - 42:00 min.). Balconies and our window views became important tools that allowed us to move from the private to the public sphere.

The time intersections in the private and public spheres

During this process, we became aware of another critical intersection, which was the technicality of our everyday routines. Thinking was not part of our everyday life, going to work at a certain time, dressing according to a certain dress code, having breakfast, getting the kids to school on time, attending school at a certain time, leaving school, picking up the kids from school, preparing and eating dinner, washing the dishes... all these rankings, which are part of our everyday life, were carried out in a purely technical way:

...people thought, for example, we are at home, we are ready to do many things. We lost our ability to divide the whole day according to such a modern understanding again when we started staying at home. The house has its rhythm, and we broke our ties with the house. Maybe now we will start catching the rhythm of the house by being a family in a modern context (Emel, April 15th, 2020 - 10:00 min.).

The feeling of pleasure was completely alien to these life routines. With the shifting of the responsibilities of the public into our private sphere, all of our well-organized routines have been turned upside down. Although living without a schedule was a problem at first, it turned into a process that later brought joy. Having a no-schedule, no-time pressure life following the monotonous modern model has brought together many feelings and a sense of joy, crossing our path with the facts we had long planned. Also, we were amazed at first that getting out of the routine made us panic and at the same time the problem-solving minds started working harder to adapt to this new situation. So we started to think more critically about our old life routine and our new life routines that we should develop.

Time to awaken the white feminists¹ in us

In doing so, we found that we were not able to meet

¹ White feminism is the term reflected by the participant, it is not terminology based on the literature background.

many new requirements, such as sewing a mask, cooking every day, cleaning every day, cutting our hair. Some of us were giving lectures on our field and then suddenly we got into a process of online teaching mode. We enjoyed directing the lives of our students, but then everything turned upside down. As academics, we started developing fun activities for our students who had to stay home due to the quarantine, so they could have a more joyful and meaningful time with their siblings:

'students who were not allowed to study out of town, returned home, and their only escape was the university campus, the only place where they could breathe and be free. Now they probably cook, do housework instead of homework and take care of their siblings all day' (Gupse, April 6th, 2020 - 75:00 min.).

Although most of us wanted to be in the classroom teaching our students, we were trying to figure out what knowledge would be most appropriate at the time. Oddly enough, preparing a pancake recipe turned out to be the most valuable productive knowledge at the moment. Lectures on Foucault, Goffman, Hobbes, Habermas, C++, Management, Cognitive Psychology were of importance during studies. In this new situation, the knowledge we were imparting at the university was insufficient and we felt that we should also provide our students with other information. All of these intersections between our public and our private spheres have awakened the white feminist in us. It was obvious that we were incompetent for these new tasks because we didn't know many things like traditional cooking, sewing and even housework because we didn't want to be like our mothers. In the name of feminism, we have long resisted being traditional women; we were ready to be heterodox. However, the most needed things during this social quarantine were sewing masks, baking pancakes and baking cakes with our kids. Indeed, in this process we have found that the information about what is required at the moment has become more important; Unfortunately, other information wasn't that important:

'the little things we tried in this process, this chaotic situation reminded us of before, for example collecting the leftovers after our grandmothers finished sewing' (Zumra April 6th, 2020 - 95: 00 min.).

Due to lack of time and fast life of classroom teaching mode and online teaching mode, especially in academy, we were unaware of the importance of these traditional products made by our mothers and grandmothers. The main reason for these memories of the past was that the brain, free from the constraints of time, got out of the routine. In order not to neglect this production, which always existed in the private sphere, especially for women, it could not be evaluated by the standards of the capitalist order. Women who cook with children and engage in distance learning had to direct the lives of their students and show their productivity by showing up again

and again in the groups, student platforms, educational and informational platforms they formed.

Fitting the all requirements of public and private sphere in the Holy Month of Ramadan²

Ramadan 2020 began on the evening of Thursday April 23rd. The meeting right before Ramadan was on April 22nd and we started to reschedule the time of our meetings according to Iftar³ and Salah time: *'There is one more thing, the month of Ramadan is coming, when do we meet [laughs]? I think it will be a little less productive. I have even moved my classes to night, but if this is a situation that will affect you too much, I will follow you; I will do as you say, but I prefer the night because we do not sleep until dawn and go to bed after morning prayers. So [laughs]' (Didem, April 26th, 2020).*

The question was fully related to all aspects of the coronavirus incident. What was our new routine? We have tried to understand this change. How long can our old life go on now? Was the old normal or was the new normal? Was our new normal our real normal?

Ramadan experience, especially after moving to Elazig, is different for me. I wanted to have an iftar outside, but booking for a single person is not possible where I live; restaurants did not want to give me a table [laughed]. After this painful experience, this Ramadan, I can eat regularly, both at sahoor and in the evening with my sister. Here in this situation, we are experiencing the beauty of Ramadan. It is a very positive effect for me to experience peace and happiness (Zumra, April 26th, 2020).

While some of us found joy in meeting at a restaurant for iftar time, others enjoyed being alone and socializing less. The notion of sociability in this context encompasses rich traditions, norms and rituals in eastern Turkey: *'My children and I are together and the three of us have different ways of spending time together, when my son went to sleep we woke up. We could not meet at the table for dinner before this Ramadan. Now, thanks to Iftar, we can sit at the same table. That was the beauty of Ramadan. You do not get tired in terms of socializing because you do not have to go out to prepare your home for a crowded iftar table; it is easier' (Tahire, April 26th, 2020).* During Ramadan, we became online guests in each other's homes and kitchens to help prepare for iftar time: *'I'm making a pie with minced meat because I have*

² The month of Ramadhan [is that] in which was revealed the Qur'an (2:185), a guidance for the people and clear proofs of guidance and criterion. So whoever sights [the new moon of] the month, let him fast it; and whoever is ill or on a journey - then an equal number of other days. Allah intends for you ease and does not intend for you hardship and [wants] for you to complete the period and to glorify Allah for that [to] which He has guided you; and perhaps you will be grateful.

³ It indicates time of breaking the fast '... and eat and drink until the whiteness of the day becomes distinct from the blackness of the night at dawn, then complete the fast till nighttime' (Holy Qur'an, Surah Baqarah 2:187)

an hour left until iftar. Having Ramadan at home is better because my daily routine in the previous Ramadan was difficult to organize with tasks in university, cooking, childcare, housework. All of these were my duties. Normally I couldn't catch up on time in Ramadan, but now everything can be arranged without any problems' (Didem, April 26th, 2020). It was symbolic to meet at this time to keep alive one religious ritual and old tradition. We met online in private space to practice public events.

The tools intersection of the roles in the private sphere and public sphere

The intersections we experienced in the instrumental context emerged in concepts that we did not have to use in the private field. The headscarves we used in the public sphere, the intense use of our computers exposed us to the world during the pandemic. The same attention that was in the public sphere was used in the private sphere. Our computers kept us connected to the life in the outside world and brought us together with our loved ones. However, one of the questions we all asked during this process was how to reach the graves of our loved ones because no matter where they may be, we were unable to visit the graves due to spatial constraints, and we thought of our dead ones more than usual. Obviously, it seemed that we have now managed to adapt our functionality, which we achieved by using many tools in the public sphere of the classrooms, in front of the cameras on our computers during this pandemic. Suddenly, our computers became our world; yes, they allowed us to contact the world, but something was missing. It could not help us reach those who migrated to the hereafter.

The headscarf dilemma in privacy in front of the camera or not to wear

In our ninth meeting on April 29, 2020, the leader of the meeting listed the following questions:

So what role does the headscarf play in our daily life? What do we do at home? What do we do when we enter a meeting? Because the thing is, we usually wear the headscarf in the public sphere, we do not wear it in the private sphere, and how did our relationship with the headscarf changed in the private sphere? I normally wear my hijab in a more formal way when going out. But now, I do not pay much attention to my headscarf, especially on online platforms where I participate with people from my close circle. Actually, the headscarf is a tool we use when we go out in the public sphere. But now that we are entering the public sphere through online platforms, the headscarf has changed its meaning in the old public sphere (Emel, April 29th, 2020).

Women do not necessarily cover their heads or have to wear their headscarves at home, but in this new standard era, wearing a headscarf has become a necessity for most of us as we spend most of a day in front of the home computer in online meetings with our students or on educational platforms. Not just us, all family members had online meetings or classes, and in order not to appear in front of someone else's camera, most of us started wearing headscarves in private:

In fact, the headscarf is a tool that is not used in the private area, I am having an awful lot of trouble, and I am afraid of being caught by my children's or husband's camera in my private sphere. When I look at our current life, even a simple act of serving tea to my husband became a torture because of the fear of being caught by his camera. I started admiring today what I was criticizing yesterday: a guest room in the Turkish cultural context because it is a necessity in these pandemic conditions, in our Big Brother concept (Ezel, April 29th, 2020).

Although only women held these meetings, we always went to the meetings with a headscarf because we were aware that others might see us in front of the camera: *'We mostly wore our headscarves comfortably (Didem, April 29th, 2020).*

'But during the lecture, of course, I had to pay attention to my clothes and what they should look like. The university has already sent us an instruction to describe how to conduct our online meetings or courses' (Tahire, April 29th, 2020). Finally, we tried to understand the reason for discussing this particular topic:

Headscarf is neither sacred nor symbolic; it is a rationality tool to communicate with the Creator. I love wearing headscarf because it provides me with a strong relationship with Allah; however, after I started wearing headscarf, the society began to see me as a Muslim, and they explicitly made me a representative of all women wearing headscarf. My mistakes were not anymore considered belonging to an individual or Emel. They started being the fault of all women with a headscarf (Emel, April 29th, 2020).

Computers: Device for survival and surveillance

During this process, our computers or cell phones continued to be devices that begin to feel expelled out of the public space when taken from our hands. The most important devices that give us the feeling of being in the public sphere were the most essential devices that enabled us to complete our online lessons by placing them on the kitchen counter in our small houses where we do not even have a work desk: *"I brought my electronic devices from school to be able to hold online lessons; it is in a corner of the bedroom, close to the closet because there is not enough space to place it somewhere else" (Elzem, April 4th, 2020–22:32 min.).*

No matter how many of them a family have, it is never enough because they enable all family members to fulfill their public sphere responsibilities simultaneously on multiple computers: *"I have a duty as a teacher to keep my children calm during this time; a mobile phone is the only tool to keep them away from another tool, my computer camera" (Serap, April 06th, 2020 – 37:07 min.).* These devices did not just replace our class devices, *"the camera functions as a surveillance mechanism as well" (Gupse, April 29th, 2020 - 26:27 min.).* However, the computer in our house became the most important tool to connect to the outside world with our family members and organize activities, such as concerts, surprise birthday parties, etc.

DISCUSSION

The participants' auto-ethnographic self-reflection gains in importance when analyzed as a whole in the study. They were affected by various aspects of private and public interactions in their daily lives. This study aims to reflect all of their worries, fears and expectations of themselves. For this reason, the data collection is completed with the unique method of autoethnography. Overall, these transformation processes of COVID-19 are simultaneously becoming a new social phenomenon of the postmodern research agenda. It created a very traumatic juggling effect on the women in this study, particularly due to their traumatic past challenges of being part of the public eye through discipline, surveillance, and self-censorship. Publishing, teaching, and administrative duties intersected heavily with serving tea for their husbands, assisting with their children's activities, cleaning, cooking, and washing. In this context, by illuminating the perspectives on space, time, tools, and other outcomes of these breakdowns, intersectionality's analyzes and insights contribute to the literature on COVID-19 and feminism and to further research on renormalization solutions. The most striking feature of the study is that most of the participants wore headscarves, had previously been excluded from the public because of their religious beliefs and had a traumatic past in this regard. The fact that the epidemic pulled them out of the public sphere and forced them to exist in the private sphere not only resurrected their past traumas, but also caused them to reluctantly begin to share their experiences with what was left of the reflections evaluate the past. The importance of the autoethnographic method was seen here in closing the healing gap between public and private areas with the reflections of the participants. During the pandemic, their memories of past exclusion from the public sphere were awakened by combining the autobiographical impulse described by looking inward gaze with the ethnographic impulse of looking outward gaze. Every shared experience took on a special and valuable meaning for these women who were struggling to be in the public eye.

These results were chosen for this reason, to reflect their unique experience.

The COVID-19 crisis has evidently disrupted normal forms of outreach and participation in public life. In this sense, the old traditional public became inaccessible due to health risk factors. The lockdown of public space has gradually changed everyday life, lifestyle and culture by shifting all responsibilities of public space to the private sphere. Social distancing restrictions, along with their public lifestyle, initially pushed individuals into their privacy, where they were forced to attend to both public duties and household chores. Then the mask-wearing requirements forced people to use their computers or mobile phones to access online meeting platforms at local, national and transnational levels to catch up with their loved ones, students, friends and colleagues.

These insights and evaluations reintroduce our group analysis, which must cover the intersectionality of both spheres, because these seven Muslim women have made a conscious choice to be part of the public since childhood. Everyone became aware that public entry was only possible through studies and a job. Because of this, most of them refused to learn the traditional female chores, and most of us were incompetent in those roles. As part of our lives, intersectionality has been blurred with happiness in being in the public eye; However, the heavy intersection of privacy and publicity left us feeling incompetent with constant self-censorship. In this vein, women have also signaled that self-censorship falls short of their responsibilities in the competitive academic environment when it comes to publishing material that measures productivity in the public space. Public pressure, countable productivity, was an issue that made us, as representatives of the female gender, feel that we were not meeting the requirements because productivity in the private sphere was not supported to challenge countable production in capitalism's labor discipline. However, COVID-19 has opened the door for masses to inquire about this real burden on women's shoulders, as forthcoming studies like this one will reflect science from our homes as our fields of study to uncover reality.

Conclusion

COVID 19 and the quarantine have made us understand that we have all consciously internalized being part of the public eye as headscarf wearers and realize that we do not approve of the traditional female lifestyle. It was only in 2013 that six of the seven participants in the study in Turkey were given the right to work in public spaces with their headscarves on. COVID-19 has pushed many people out of the public eye and into the private sphere, and social quarantine has unleashed their deeply traumatized consciousness. There is panicked with the already experienced feeling of being alienated and

isolated from the public again. While all do not accept feminism in the fullest sense, it was during this time that we discovered that there was a secret white feminist within us. We began to strengthen our relationships with public sector responsibilities. When we were locked in houses, participants from the east region thought that their students, especially their female students, were greatly affected by this situation. They tried to develop something suitable to keep them active in the private sphere.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES

- Andrew A, Cattan S, Dias MC, Farquharson C, Kraftman L, Krutikova S, Phimister A, Sevilla A (2020). Parents, especially mothers, paying heavy price for lockdown. The IFS. Available at: <https://www.ifs.org.uk/publications/14861> (Accessed: 21 January 2021).
- Bochner A, Ellis C (2016). *Evocative Autoethnography: Writing Lives and Telling Stories*. Routledge.
- Creswell JW, Creswell JD (2017). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage publications.
- Costa DM (1995). 'Capitalism and reproduction', *Open marxism* 3:7-16.
- Doucet A (1996). 'Encouraging voices: Towards more creative methods for collecting data on gender and household labour', in *Gender relations in public and private*. Springer, pp. 156-175.
- Ellis C (2004). *The Ethnographic I: A Methodological Novel about Autoethnography*. Rowman Altamira.
- Ellis C (2016). *Revision: Autoethnographic Reflections on Life and Work*. Routledge.
- Euronews (2020). 'Sağlık Bakanı Koca: Türkiye'de ilk koronavirüs (Covid-19) vakası tespit edildi', <https://tr.euronews.com/2020/03/10/sagl-k-bakan-koca-koronavirus-covid-19-salg-n-ile-ilgili-ac-klama-yap-yor>
- Foucault M (1979). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. (Trans A. Sheridan). Oxford, England: Vintage (Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison. (Trans A. Sheridan)), pp. ix, 333.
- Gabster BP, van Daalen K, Dhath R, Barry M (2020). Challenges for the female academic during the COVID-19 pandemic. *The Lancet* 395(10242):1968-1970.
- Habermas J, Lennox S, Lennox F (1974). 'The Public Sphere: An Encyclopedia Article (1964)', *New German Critique*, 3:49-55.
- Nowotny H, Scott P, Gibbons M (2003). 'Introduction: Mode 2 revisited: The new production of knowledge', *Minerva*, 41(3):179-194.
- Wall S (2006). 'An Autoethnography on Learning About Autoethnography', *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(2):146-160.